

**THE CHICO RIVER BASIN DEVELOPMENT PROJECT:
A CASE STUDY IN NATIONAL DEVELOPMENT POLICY
An Update**

Joanna K. Cariño

Introduction

Last year, a group of three social scientists in the Cordilleras got together to produce a collective paper on the Chico River Basin Development Project (CRBDP) which was presented at the 2nd National Conference of Ugat held in Baguio City. Because of numerous constraints, chief among which were the lack of time for preparation and the lack of information about the project itself from government, the final paper was rather disorganized, discontinuous at some points, and was more like a first draft than a finished paper. Of course, the fact that the different writers of the paper had varying styles and points of concentration only served to make more marked the weakness of discontinuity and disorganization, since there was then no time for a final editing of what was a collection of short articles on the different aspects of the CRBDP.

Disorganized as the paper was, our main aim was to use the CRBDP as a case study in national development policy, with the end in view of recommending to this Anthropological Association a deeper involvement in the serious inquiry into development in our country, since the development projects of government always seem to generate controversy and opposition from the people most affected by these projects. Inasmuch as the object of our calling is the study of humankind, if we expect our profession to be of real service in a Third World country like the Philippines, we have to address our study to the most pressing peoples' problems in our day and age. We would, therefore, consider it well worth the effort of preparing last year's paper and this present update if there would be a few among us here who would be so motivated to go into further studies along the same or similar lines, for the purpose of having our observations about policy-making and implementation heard, in whatever way we can.

Since last year's collective paper, we have been able to go into a more concentrated study of the CRBDP, with the result that the original paper has now been completely rewritten and expanded into a more integrated

whole, particularly with the addition of a thorough history of past events, which was notably missing from the original paper. The finished document is too long and unwieldy, however, for the purposes of a conference like this. This Chico Update is, therefore, just what it purports to be – an update on the latest events related to the CRBDP, with last year's UGAT conference attended by NPC President Gabriel Y. Itchon and a number of Kalinga leaders as the take-off point. Since this is only a summary of the most important events, we are including several appendices to supply whatever details are necessary. Before the update itself, however, we are including an integrated summary of the proposed project, its implications on the lives of the affected populations, the peoples' opposition to the project, and a reiteration of some points raised in last year's paper as a general back-grounder to the CRBDP.

The Proposed Project

The Chico river is the longest and most elaborate river system in the Grand Cordillera mountain ranges that form the backbone of Northern Luzon. Draining a large part of the Central Cordilleras, the Chico flows north from its headwaters at Mt. Data coursing through Mountain Province before it gouges northwest, entering the sub-province of Kalinga, then cuts to the northeast to join the Cagayan river which reaches the sea at Aparri. The Philippine government has been considering the construction of hydro-electric dams along the Chico since 1965. Earlier studies, however, did not find such dams feasible because of high construction costs. The increased price of oil in the early 70's and the threat of an energy crisis convinced the government that the cost-benefit ratio could then be revised in favor of the dams. Convinced of the substantial hydro-electric power that the river could contribute to the Luzon Grid, the National Power Corporation (NPC) in 1972 included the pre-feasibility study on the Chico river basin in the package of projects to be financed by the World Bank under the fifth power loan. The German firm Lahmeyer International GMBH (Frankfurt) was contracted to undertake the study.

In June 1973, Lahmeyer, in association with the Engineering and Development Corporation of the Philippines (EDCOP), submitted its Technical Pre-Feasibility Study of the Hydro-Electric Development in the Chico River. The study identifies the following dam sites in the Chico river basin as technically feasible for development.

Proposed Dams along the Chico River

Dam	Location	Potential Capacity
Chico I	Sabangan, Mt. Province	100 MW
Chico II	Sadanga, Mt. Province	360 MW
Chico III	Basao, Kalinga-Apayao	100 MW
Chico IV	Tomiangan, Kalinga-Apayao	450 MW
Total Capacity		1010 megawatts

Source: Lahmeyer International GmbH, Technical Pre-Feasibility Study of the Hydro-Electric Development in the Chico River. Frankfurt: Lahmeyer International, June 1973.

Chico II, Chico III and Chico IV were found to be economically feasible when compared with similar projects elsewhere. The favorable costs for Chico III, however, could hold only if it is considered in conjunction with Chico II, benefitting from the latter's regulation of flow. Alone, it would not be so feasible. Although Chico I was not as economically attractive as the other three dams, no final judgment on its viability could be made without a thorough economic analysis. The preliminary cost estimates recommended the following order of merit for construction in terms of production costs: first – Chico II; second – Chico III; third – Chico IV; fourth – Chico I. The Lahmeyer study further recommended that in order to make the proposed dams economically more attractive, their multi-purpose development should be explored, particularly with regard to irrigation use. Accordingly, the National Irrigation Administration (NIA) prepared a feasibility study for the Chico River Irrigation Project (CRIP), designed to utilize the peaking discharges from the NPC hydro-electric dams for irrigation purposes.

Acting on the recommendations of the Lahmeyer pre-feasibility study, the Philippine government in 1974 sent off its power-implementing agency, the NPC, on initial survey and reconnaissance trips to the Chico II, III and IV damsites. Chico II, the Anabel-Tocucan dam at Sadanga was given top priority in the construction schedule of the whole project with full blast construction projected for 1977 and completion by 1982. All the other dam sites were to be thoroughly surveyed towards the completion of the feasibility study for the CRBDP by 1978-79.

From the start, however, this ambitious development project which proposes to build four dams along the Chico river and at its confluence with the Pasil river in Kalinga, was met with relentless opposition from the natives of Mountain Province and Kalinga. It has not been able to proceed

as scheduled, and its timetable has already been delayed by a number of years. The people's opposition had also caused, in 1975, the temporary suspension of all dam-connected activities at the three dam sites, and the deferral of the Chico II priority, such that when the NPC resumed its much delayed survey work after the temporary suspension, the Chico IV dam at Tomiangan, Kalinga-Apayao had been the new priority.

Chico IV has, since then, been the center of all government efforts at damming the Chico but, up to today, the NPC has not really gone far in its survey work because of the many hindrances and deterrents posed by the people's opposition. The present status of survey work at the Tomiangan dam site is the drilling to investigate the geology of the dam IV area, and other related tasks (land clearing, bulldozing, etc.)

The Project's Implications

The project area of the CRBDP is the total catchment area of the Chico river, from its headwaters at Mount Data down to dam IV. at Tomiangan, a total of 1400 square kilometers. All of the people in this watershed area would be affected by the project's implementation, even with the construction of only Chico IV, the present priority, since the watershed of Chico IV is, by definition, the total project area. The watershed includes the municipalities of Sabangan, Sagada, Bontoc, Sadanga, and parts of Bauko and Barlig in Mountain Province; and the municipalities of Tinglayan, Lubuagan, Pasil, and parts of Tabuk in Kalinga. One estimate puts the affected populations at around 100,000. Since as a rule, these people practice rotating swiddens (*kaingin*) in supplement to their more intensive terraced cultivation, and have done so for numerous generations in a form of ecosystem that is stable, self-perpetuating and inherently preserving, they are bound to come into conflict with the government on watershed management laws and on the ban on *kaingin* farming. And since the Bontocs' and Kalingas' *kaingin* often spell the difference between below-subsistence and surplus, they will surely not take kindly any incursion in their economic base.

The present priority, Chico IV, would directly submerge the barrios of Ableg, Cagaluan, Dupag, Tanglag, Dognac, and Mabongtot in Kalinga, making at least 672 families homeless (NPC estimates 850 families, while the provincial government of Kalinga-Apayao estimates more than 1,000 families). Fertile rice lands in these areas worth ₱31,500,000 will be flooded. In addition, some 300 families of Bangad, Lubuagan, Dangtalan, Guinaang, and Naneng in Kalinga, would lose some ₱38,250,000. worth of rice fields.

The dams will uproot more than 5,000 Kalingas from their ancestral villages and farmlands. It will destroy 1,200 stone-walled rice terraces, the

pride of traditional Kalinga engineering, and ruin 500 hectares of valuable fruit trees (coffee, oranges, mangoes, etc.) which provide primary sources of cash income for the people. Along with the barrios to be submerged, will disappear 10 kilometers of national road. Lost production will amount to at least P13 million worth of fruit, vegetables and grain yearly (by 1972 prices), excluding the many benefits the Kalingas enjoy from their abundant forests, their rich hunting grounds and their rivers – the Chico and its tributaries – free firewood, wild game, fish and ell, etc.

Aside from the great destruction to the people's natural and self-sufficient economy, there are a number of political, religious and cultural considerations which make the issue of dislocation/relocation mean the death of the Kalingas as a people (and also of the Bontocs, if the other dams will later be built).

The traditional religion of the people of the Chico Valley is characterized by ancestral worship, the belief and fear of the spirits of forest and field. Even today when people already accept Christianity, the respect for the power and integrity of the traditional ancestors and gods over all areas of day-to-day living still prevails. All the many ancestor and spirit gods are associated, in the people's minds, with the land of the home region. The remains of all who die, even those who may die many miles away, are brought home.

The home region – the land and all its improvements – as it appears today, is largely the accumulation of the collective efforts of deceased ancestors, of generations of cooperation between the spirits and the living. The living are the guardians of this inheritance and, therefore, have the strong responsibility for the care of the land and the dead. The ancestral spirits will hold the living accountable for any neglect in this awesome responsibility.

Ancestors and spirits are capable of bringing sickness and misfortune to the living if neglected or not given the proper respect. Most sickness, mental ill health and accidents are believed to be caused by angry spirits. Once the people allow the villages to be submerged, the spirits would be greatly displeased and would forever haunt and bring disaster to the lives of the living.

The entire religion of the Kalingas and Bontocs is tied up with their present homes along the Chico, whose very soil is made up of ancestral remains. For them, the dam project is an act of desecration against actual grave sites and homes of spirits. Further, it is the destruction of the accumulated heritage of ethnic peoples. Their acceptance of the construction of the dams would mean their acceptance of their death as distinct peoples, an event which the Bontocs and Kalingas will not allow.

Aside from the local religion, the political institution for which the people of the Chico Valley are noted is also tied up with the land of the home region. The peace pact (*Kalinga bodong*, *Bontoc pechen*) prevails over certain defined territories which the present villages occupy. Each separate peace pact between two communities defines the specific land area over which it is to be observed. Submersion of these lands and the dislocation of the people from their communities would mean the destruction of the peace pacts prevailing over these areas.

The peace pact and its system of laws (*pagta ti bodong*) is today still the most effective mechanism for social interaction and control in the peace pact areas. The barrios to be submerged by Chico IV alone hold a total of 180 peace pacts with each other and with other Kalinga, Bontoc and Tinggian communities. Submersion of the land and transfer of the inhabitants would nullify all of these. And if the peace pact system presently prevailing were to be rendered inutile by dam incursion into specific territories, the whole supportive system underlying the social structure of local society would be undermined.

The peace pact, like most socio-political institutions is best understood by reference to its problem-solving capacity. The society adapts its institutions to meet the major problems that confront it. It is, therefore, neither surprising nor abnormal to find that the *Kalinga bodong* has recently been modifying itself in adaptation to the biggest problem which the people have been faced with so far -- the external threat posed by the proposed construction of the dams.

The traditional *bodong* would involve only two villages in any given peace pact ceremony, and was more of an assertion of the sovereignty and independence of one village from the other. A number of recent peace pacts, however, have used the traditional institution to raise the unity and interdependence of all dam-affected villages in a common struggle against the construction of the dams. The December 1978 *bodong*, for instance, brought together the *papangat* (community leaders) of 21 Kalinga and Bontoc villages to consolidate the opposition to the CRBDP, recognizing that this time, the problem faced is much bigger than any two villages can handle. Aside from the expansion of the partners in the *bodong*, outside sympathizers and support groups are also being invited to the novel peace pacts, another departure from the pacts' being an internal native affair.

This recent dynamism and adaptability of the *bodong* is an on-going process first encouraged by the Bochong Conference on Development in 1975 which brought together 150 Bontoc and Kalinga leaders from the dam-affected villages and some support groups. Succeeding *bodong* renewals between villages in the dam areas necessarily included much talk about

the proposed dams and the destruction these would cause to the lives of the people. These developments culminated in the staging of two giant peace pacts in 1978 to unite the opposition to the project.

Today, an anti-dam peace pact prevails over the dam-affected villages in Kalinga and Mountain Province. A seven-point *pagta ti bodong* sets down strict restrictions against cooperating with the dam project.

A History of Opposition to the CRBDP

From the start, the Bontocs and the Kalingas were distrustful of government intentions in the Chico Valley area. They were never consulted about government plans to dam the Chico river, but in 1974, they began to get some news that their river was going to be dammed. The people of the valley faced up to the truth of the rumors when NPC survey teams arrived without notice at the Chico II, Chico III and Chico IV dam sites.

The people were understandably concerned that the NPC had been sent in to implement a project without the necessary dialogue with those who would be most affected by the dams. Thus, they boldly prevented the NPC from conducting the surveys while they rushed to make known their objections to the proposed construction of dams along the Chico. Armed Bontocs or disrobed women met the survey teams in some barrios and forced them to a hasty retreat.

Meanwhile, the people organized and financed representative delegations which were sent to the proper authorities and offices in order to raise what they felt were valid objections to the project (see earlier discussion of The Project's Implications). A Bontoc delegation from the Chico II area was able to meet with President Marcos in Malacañang but their objections were dismissed as "sentimental". The President sent the Bontocs home with promises of proper relocation and payment for all damaged properties.

The Kalingas sent down five delegations to Manila in 1974 but none of these were able to meet with the President, or with any responsible official who was in a position to do something about their petitions. They were given the run-around and shuttled off from one office to the other. Since they could not personally hold a dialogue with responsible government officials, they had to satisfy themselves with addressing numerous petitions to the President, the government agencies involved in the project, the Church, the media, the funding agency, etc. with the hope that their appeals would be heard.

None of the petitions seemed to influence the decision-makers, however. Local and regional government officials, the NPC, and military officers started calling barrio meetings aimed at convincing the people to allow the survey teams to get on with their work along the Chico and Pasil rivers.

Barrio spokesmen attempted to raise the people's objections to the project in these meetings, but to no avail. The people later refused to attend similar meetings where they had to listen but could not make themselves heard.

In May, 1975, the Bochong Conference on Development was organized by an apostolate of the Catholic Bishops Conference of the Philippines. The conference was attended by 150 Bontoc and Kalinga leaders and several church-based support groups. It was here that the anti-dam *pagta ti bodong* that presently prevails over the dam-affected areas was first drafted.

Alarmed by the widening opposition to the dam project, the government suspended all operations at the three dam-sites and withdrew all NPC personnel and equipment from the area soon after the Bochong Conference. This was only a temporary reprieve, however, for not much later, the Presidential Assistance on National Minorities (PANAMIN) arrived in Kalinga on the orders of the President that work on Chico IV be resumed. PANAMIN recommended the formation of the Kalinga Special Development Region (KSDR) which was created by Presidential Decree 848. The PANAMIN, the KSDR, and the NPC then set out on a campaign to minimize opposition to the Chico IV project by winning over certain personalities and groups in the opposition.

They had some success of winning over a few people in the opposition, usually through bribery and intimidation, but the majority of Kalingas continued to oppose the dam project. In fact, they were becoming bolder in their opposition and repeatedly tore down the work camps which the NPC tried to put up at Tomiangan under the armed protection of the Philippine Constabulary (PC) and the Integrated National Police (INP). The fourth time the Kalingas tore down the work camps, 250 Kalinga men, women and children carried back the materials from Tomiangan to the PC camp at Bulanao, Tabuk in a silent protest march of 28 kilometers which lasted through the night and through the curfew hours.

Towards the latter half of 1976, reports pointed to the entry of a cadre of the communist New People's Army (NPA) into the dam-affected areas. A number of Kalinga youths readily joined this revolutionary army, thereby linking the issue of opposition to the Chico project to the nationwide resistance being waged by the red army.

The militarization of the once-peaceful sub-province of Kalinga heightened with the creation and the arming of Civilian Home Defense Forces (CHDF) in opposition villages. More and more government troops were brought in to back up the provincial PC command until a whole battalion, the 60th PC Battalion, was assigned there.

The military initiated a wave of arrests of Kalinga and Bontoc opposition leaders after an almost total boycott of the October 1976 referendum

in the dam-affected areas. The series of arrests continued for several months until around 150 natives had been arrested and detained by April 1977. This number included many *papangat*, married couples, elderly people, women, and youth as young as 12 years of age. They were picked up on such diverse charges as obstruction of the October referendum, hampering government projects, illegal possession of firearms and subversion. Most of the detainees were kept at the PC stockade at Bulanao, Tabuk, but 50 Bontoc and Kalinga leaders were transferred to Camp Olivas, Pampanga. The NPC and the PC then took advantage of the opportunity afforded by the detention of the leading oppositionists to construct their camp-site and work station at the Tomiangan damsite.

The Church, support groups, civil libertarians, the Free Legal Assistance Group (FLAG), and even the London-based human rights institution, Amnesty International, added their efforts to those of the Kalinga and Bontoc people towards the release of the detained oppositionists. Finally, the detainees were released conditionally in June 1977. Some of them had been detained for four months, others, for as long as eight months. During their whole detention period, farms had to be left untended, homes and children were neglected, and the conditions in several barrios deteriorated so badly that some support groups had to supply the people with food.

In 1978, events seemed to point towards an increasing military solution of the conflict between the people of the Chico valley and the government over the proposed dams. On one hand, government troops launched a number of punitive raids on villages suspected of feeding and helping the NPA, whose ranks had by then expanded with Kalinga recruits who are naturally supported by their home villages. On the other hand, the Kalingas and the NPA were also able to stage a few ambushes on isolated government troops and NPC vehicles. Bloodshed occurred frequently and the number of deaths directly traceable to the dam project started to rise.

In April, the NPC was reorganized, with Gabriel Y. Itchon taking over as the new president. In June, the PANAMIN was withdrawn from the sub-province giving way to a more complete military take-over of the Chico problem. The 60th PC Battalion was soon after designated as the main force to resolve the problem. Given absolute power in Kalinga, the 60th PC Battalion soon let loose a reign of terror which resulted in a petition for their withdrawal signed by more than 1,000 Kalingas.

On September 20, 1978, the NPC camp at Tomiangan was attacked, resulting in the death of four NPC employees, with four others seriously wounded. In retaliation, the government declared Tomiangan as a "no man's land" or free fire zone, the consequences of which will be discussed further down in the update.

At the year's end, the 60th PC Battalion was pulled out from Kalinga and replaced with the 51st PC Battalion fresh from its battles in Sulu. The Kalingas and Bontocs held a grand *bodong* with 21 village participants to express the solidarity of the people against the dam project, and reiterated the anti-dam *pagta ti bodong* prevailing over the dam-affected areas.

The year 1979 appeared to be a waiting time. The government leisurely continued its drilling and survey activities at Tomiangan, but it did not attempt to resume its much-delayed waterline and geology surveys in the other villages that would be submerged if Chico IV is built. There were a number of minor encounters between government troops and the NPA, but an otherwise outwardly calm prevailed as compared with the swift and dramatic events in 1978.

In fact, for a time, the Chico issue was eclipsed in the news by other events in Kalinga, particularly the break in the peace pact and the corresponding bloodshed between Lubo and Mangali, two barrios of the non-dam-affected municipality of Tanudan in Kalinga. The long-standing feud between the Butbut (Kalinga) and the Sadanga (Mountain Province) was settled, and their peace pact restored, an event which was welcomed by those opposed to the dam since these are both dam-affected communities along the Chico.

Last year's UGAT conference was one of those rare opportunities when NPC President Itchon and several Kalinga *papangat* were together at the same forum but it just served to illustrate how irreconcilable the two opposing views to the dam project are.

In October, the 51st PC Battalion was replaced by the 44th Army Battalion, newly transferred from its counter-insurgency campaign in nearby Isabela. The people interpreted this change to mean that the government is preparing itself for bigger military campaigns, for the Army reportedly is better trained than the PC in jungle warfare and in the single-minded pursuit of NPA guerillas.

Update: Tomiangan – No Man's Land

It is on the 27 households of Tomiangan that the heaviest burden of opposition to the dam project is presently being carried. Tomiangan is the site of the Chico IV dam – the present government priority. It is also the site of the NPC workcamp which was attacked on September 20, 1978, resulting in the death of four NPC employees and the serious wounding of four others.

After the aforementioned attack, the NPC and the military declared a vast area with a 500 meter radius from the workcamps as a "no man's land" or literally a free-fire zone. All animals found roaming in this area

are fair game for governmental troops, as are humans, if they do not have a permit from the military unit assigned there.

Taking the NPC camp as the central point (although in land area it is considerably bigger than a point), the no-man's-land covers an approximate area of 785,400 square meters. This land area includes rice fields, coffee plantations, fruit orchards, *kaingin* plots, pasture lands and forests. In order for the people at Barrio Tomiangan and nearby Sadog Naneng and Dupag to be able to visit their agricultural fields and clearings there they have to secure work permits from the military. The work permits are from 9 AM to 3 PM only. Since the fields and *kaingin* patches are rather far away from the above-mentioned barrios, the people have very little time to work in the fields. As a consequence, the fields have been left largely uncultivated and untended greatly reducing the people's food supply and cash crops.

Work animals like cows and carabaos roaming within the restricted area simply disappear. A certain Juan Suma-al lost all his 140 cows that used to graze in a wide pastureland prior to the declaration of no-man's-land. He claims that there are witnesses who could testify that his cows were eaten by the soldiers "but they are afraid to talk".

Furthermore, the NPC's drilling and bulldozing activities are carried out without consideration for plants and coffee trees damaged, and the destruction of large areas of agricultural, and in some cases, residential land. The military troops further aggravate this unrestrained destruction of the people's livelihood by doing target practice at the coconuts in the trees or on the dogs and pigs in the settlements.

The people's livelihood has been so seriously damaged by all of the above practices of the NPC and the military that the threat of starvation hovers. Families are now having the most difficult time sending their children to school. Income from coffee sales, which could reach P30,000 per family in a good year, have fallen drastically.

The people's demands for just compensation for damaged or lost properties have not been met. The Tomiangan families are, therefore, accusing the dam implementors of intentionally depriving them of their sources of livelihood to force them to leave the dam site so that the drilling and other activities can continue. Even in the face of such deprivation, however, the 27 households of Tomiangan refuse to leave their village because departure would mean heightened NPC activity towards the construction of Chico IV.

Update: NPC-Kalinga Dialogue

On February 3, 1980, a busload of Kalinga *papangat* were in Baguio

for a dialogue with NPC President Gabriel Y. Itchon. An NPC-chartered Dangwa bus went from barrio to barrio in the Chico IV-affected area and brought the community leaders from Kalinga to the hydro-electric dam-site at Binga, Itogon, Benguet.

The Kalingas did not want to meet with Itchon unless there were other witnesses to the dialogue. Such an attitude on their part is a throwback to the time when Manda Elizalde of PANAMIN organized a Kalinga delegation to Malacañang in December 1975. The Kalingas who went were isolated from each other in hotel rooms, and bribed, threatened or harassed into signing their names to an endorsement of Chico IV. They later retracted the endorsement as being made under duress. Since then, all of them stick together when they have to leave Kalinga, and also demand that there be other witnesses present.

Accordingly, some of the Kalingas managed to reach the Montanosa Social Action Center (MSAC) in Baguio City the morning of February 3 to request the presence of witnesses at the dialogue. MSAC tried to look for local newsmen but since there was so little time before the scheduled dialogue in the afternoon, none was able to make it. Only Fr. Patricio Guyguyon of MSAC and Sr. Rosalina from Lubuangan were able to accompany the Kalingas.

At Binga, the *papangat* spoke one after the other reiterating their uncompromising opposition to the construction of Chico IV and to their proposed relocation. They then asked Itchon directly if the government would continue with the dam in spite of the local population's total opposition to the project. Itchon gave a talk about the huge costs the country has to pay for its oil and the need, therefore, to develop hydro-electric dams for electricity generation. He ended by saying, "We have no choice but to go ahead with it." Upon hearing this, the Kalingas stated that they would have to go home then to prepare for the coming confrontations as the government was determined to construct the dam.

The February 3 dialogue clearly illustrated the irreconcilable conflict between the Kalinga people and the government over the dam issue. NPC publicly announced to the people its intentions of pursuing the project. The Kalingas vocally asserted their intentions of defying NPC plans. It was tantamount to a declaration of war on each other.

The appendix provides the documentation by the Montanosa Social Action Center of the proceedings of the NPC-Kalinga dialogue.

Update: Militarization of Kalinga

Since October 1979, the 44th Army Battalion has been the military

unit on special assignment at the Chico IV-affected areas. Composed of 700 to 800 men, it coordinates its activities with the 150-man provincial PC command, the Integrated National Police (INP), and troops of the PC Regional Command II (Recom II, Tuguegarao) who also roam the sub-province. In addition, there are the Civilian Home Defense Forces and paid civilian informers of the various military intelligence units.

The 44th Army Battalion adopted a low profile early in their assignment to Kalinga while they tried to establish good relations with the people. Before long, however, they established detachments at all the barrios along the Chico to keep a closer watch on the activities of the people. Since the Kalings are openly vocal of their opposition to Chico IV, and resentful of the military, the 44th Army Battalion soon enough slipped into the ways of its PC predecessors. More and more Kalings could be heard complaining of maltreatment and military abuse. One Camilo Saeng of Tinglayan, a driver of a Ford Fiera, was stopped and beaten up without warning, on suspicion that he was an NPA supporter.

After the Binga February 3 dialogue, there was a noticeable rise of military activity in Kalinga, from government troops, the NPA and the Kalinga resistance.

On February 13, one M16 armalite and a grenade launcher disappeared from the Army detachment at the Bugnay gate. Bugnay, in the municipality of Tinglayan, is the first Kalinga barrio at the Mountain Province – Kalinga border and is located right beside the Chico. The Army soldiers at the detachment called for reinforcements from the company headquarters at Basao, the next barrio, and detained two Bugnay villagers on suspicion that they were the ones who stole the weapons.

The truckload of reinforcements shot at the whole village across the river from the roadside, causing damage to many houses. Since the people were forewarned, they were able to seek cover and none was injured.

The Army took the two Bugnay villagers, Pedro and Robert, to the company headquarters where they were repeatedly mauled for five days although there was no evidence that they had stolen the arms. Two other youths from the village were also picked up on the same suspicion and maltreated at the company headquarters.

Acting on an anonymous tip, the barrio captain, accompanied by some soldiers, was later able to locate the arms, buried around 20 meters away from the detachment. The suspects were released but by then they were practically unrecognizable due to their maltreatment. They have filed a case against the involved Army personnel.

On February 27, an Army jeep was ambushed between Tinglayan and Bangad. An officer and four enlisted men were killed. The Army retali-

ated by a punitive raid on Bangad and established a company headquarters in the barrio. A 5 P.M. - 5 A.M. curfew was imposed on the people.

A week later, three Army soldiers and two NPC personnel were ambushed when they attempted to do some drilling outside the NPC camp at the Tomiangan dam site. Only one survived with serious wounds. There are reports that after this ambush, outside drilling has been stopped temporarily, but not before bulldozing activities over rice fields and coffee plantations were intensified, thereby damaging further the people's welfare in the no-man's-land.

A number of NPA surrenderees and civilian informers have been killed. These events, plus the killing of the NPC Kalinga personnel at the Tomiangan ambush, led toward a stricter implementation of the *pagta ti bodong* for Chico IV, which prohibits, under the penalty of death, Kalingas from working with NPC or the government towards dam construction.

The people of Bugnay, Basao and Tinglayan made representations with the Defense officials in Manila regarding numerous cases of military abuse in their areas. They recommended the withdrawal of the PC detachments in their barrios, which was the source of most of the frictions between the Army and the villagers. The detachments in these areas were consequently pulled out on March 19, but bigger concentrations of troops were ordered for Bangad and for all of the subsequent barrios of Tinglayan, Lubuagan, Pasil and down to Tabuk.

The detachments in these barrios stop all vehicles and inspect the passengers and their cargoes. They require everybody to have their residence certificates (*cedula*), and anybody who cannot produce his/her *cedula* is immediately questioned, pushed around, or detained. People suspected of being members or supporters of the NPA are continually harassed, and often tortured to force them to admit links with the revolutionary army. Government troops regularly make lighting raids and punitive strikes on villages suspected of housing and feeding the NPA.

In an area where the Kalinga struggle against the CRBDP appears to have merged with the NPA's armed revolt against the present Philippine system, the latest events seem to foreshadow the making of another Mindanao situation in the North.

Conclusions

Since the start of the conflict over the CRBDP, more than 100 people have died, by one count, under situations directly attributed to the project. The bigger percentage is counted from among government troops, NPC personnel and Kalinga collaborators, but a large number have also died from

the civilian population.

Is the dam worth all of these bloodshed?

Last year, we also raised certain points that would weigh against the economic rationale for the project, chief among which were social costs not properly given consideration in its cost-benefit comparison, such as the militarization and bloodshed in the sub-province. (Aghamtao 2:37-153). These questions are just as valid today.

Aside from questions raised on the economic viability of the CRBDP, we would like to extend this year's inquiry into the beneficiaries of the all-out expansion of the country's electricity generation, and the reasons why projects such as this and the Bataan Nuclear Plant, among others, are top-priority national development projects.

Contrary to the government's much-vaunted rural electrification program (the development strategy to generate higher production and therefore higher incomes in the rural areas through electricity-generated productive ventures), about ninety percent (90%) of the electricity generated in the Philippines is used in urban-industrial enclaves which contain no more than thirty percent (30%) of the population. Around the Metro Manila area, the biggest industrial user of electricity is the copper-exporting Marinduque Mining and Industrial Corporation, which is largely-owned and managed by American and Canadian interests. It is followed by the paper mills, also foreign-capitalized; chemical industries which include such U.S. giants as Procter and Gamble (Philippines) and Colgate-Palmolive; and steel industries which are dominated by Japanese and U.S. capitalists.

Another major user of electricity is the Bataan Export Processing Zone in Mariveles, the site for privilege-laden foreign investments in the country. Seventy per cent (70%) of all commodities produced in the zone are earmarked for export. Since the electricity-consuming sectors of Philippine agriculture are also export-oriented (e.g., 61 per cent of sugar production, which takes up three percent of all industrial electricity in its milling operations, is exported), much of the Philippines' electricity is therefore, embodied in exports used by the global rich in the U.S. and North America, Japan and Western Europe.

The corporate customers of electrical power are not the only multinational enterprises benefiting from the government's electrification strategy. American, Japanese, and European suppliers of equipment, builders, and banks all profit directly, and manufacturers of electrical appliances reap increased sales as well. Manufacturers of generators, turbines and other capital goods, operating below capacity because of restrained demand from their domestic economies, are major beneficiaries.

Electrification benefits consultants and engineering contractors, such as Lahmeyer International. A USAID pamphlet (Frank Denton, Philippine

Rural Electrification: Social Analysis) reveals:

The AID-financed assistance to the NEA (National Electrification Administration) has encouraged US private trade and investment. A large proportion of AID-financed commodities have been contracted by private U.S. companies. In addition, a U.S. consulting firm, Stanley Consultants and the National Rural Electric Corporation Associates have provided technical assistance to the NEA since the beginning of the Rural Electrification Program.

In the light of these direct beneficiaries of the country's total electrification program, shouldn't we ask whether the CRBDP is for national development or for foreign development?

Appendix NPC-Kalinga Dialogue

Montanosa Social Action Center
Sunday, February 3, 1980
10:30 A.M.

Ten Kalinga leaders, including Macliing, came to MSAC. A busload of Kalinga leaders were in Baguio for a dialogue with NPC President Itchon. The NPC-hired Dangwa bus had brought them from Kalinga to Binga. Arriving at 3:00 a.m., the Kalingas refused to go to the quarters prepared for them. They stayed in the bus until daylight.

After breakfast at 7:00 a.m., they requested the NPC to take them to Baguio since Itchon was to arrive only in the afternoon and they themselves had to look for other Kalingas in Baguio.

This was their strategy to get out of Binga and look for MSAC and newsmen to accompany them back to Binga and serve as witnesses to a proper dialogue. They wanted no tricks from NPC. Elizalde's tactics in the past was still very much in their minds.

3:00 P.M.

Trip to Binga. No newsman arrive on time for the trip. Only Sister Rosalina and Father Pat accompany the group.

Binga Hydro-electric Plant
Itogon, Benguet
4:50 P.M.

Assembly at an open space at the hilltop Guesthouse, Binga. NPC staff offer snacks which the Kalingas do not accept. Itchon and six NPC

officials, two of them vice-presidents, seat themselves at the head table facing the Kalingas already seated in rows of chairs. No uniformed guards visible. NPC security chief, in civilian clothes, is seated near the Kalingas. Microphones and a regular tape recorder are put in position. There are at least three NPC personnel with mini-tape recorders.

The NPC official who escorted the men from Kalinga opens the meeting by introducing them in groups to the NPC staff. Then he says to the Kalingas, "You are in Binga, you have seen the dam, a beautiful construction; you see all these bright lights . . . It will be something like these that will be constructed and provided for you in your barrios " (in Ilokano).

Itchon cuts in, saying, "I think we have come here for a meeting, but you are already lecturing to them. We are supposed to be listening to them." He shifts to Ilocano, making apologies for his poor Ilocano (he grew up in Vigan but stayed very long in Manila). He immediately invites the Kalingas to speak.

First Kalinga, Macliing:

After a few moments of hesitation, Macliing goes to a microphone: "I have only one thing to state here: your project proposal of building dams along our rivers will mean the destruction of all our properties on which our very life depends. We Kalingas were once known for our well-kept place, but your dam project has brought only trouble among us. We, therefore, ask you: forget your dams, we don't want them."

Itchon acknowledges the speaker with a nod and then encourages Balucnit of Cagaluan to take his turn at the microphone.

Second Kalinga:

Balucnit says, "I have travelled through the lowlands and noted that people there could perhaps own pieces of land from two to five hectares. But they can get hungry, as they depend only on the production of rice of these few hectares. This is not so with us in Kalinga. . . . we don't go hungry. We have whole mountainsides for other crops besides our rice . . . The electricity that you produce here. . . where does it go but to factories and the houses of the wealthy? . . . I ask you, in the name of the people who sent me here, relocate the dams elsewhere where there will be little damage."

Third Kalinga:

"What I say is simple enough: We don't want the dam! Your dam has brought our people untold sufferings. Our forefathers prepared the land for us and now the crops of the present generation are to be destroyed? I tell you, sir, even your relocation is equivalent to our death! Even the climate of the relocation site makes it unfit for us."

Fourth Kalinga:

"Our coming to this place was at your bidding. Anyway, the people of our barrios chose us to represent them before you. The message they want to tell you is this: No dams! As we have already said in the past, we would rather die in our barrios than leave them in favor of the dams."

5th Kalinga:

"I have come here to convey to you the sentiments of my people. You know, my people have feelings! They want me to tell you this: 'No dams for us, and no relocation!' It has been our experience that of those of us who had left our barrio, some got sick and died, others had to come back home. You must understand us; only with much difficulty can we leave our places."

6th Kalinga:

"I did not personally intend to come here, but because of your letter, the elders of Tomiangan said to me, 'Go, plead with Itchon to help us, to have mercy on us people of the affected areas by stopping the dam project!' Since 1964, the start of this problem, nothing but more troubles have come to our families. Now we have this occasion to tell you, '*pangats*' of the government, what we Kalinga *pangats* have to say. Many of us you, of the Government, detained for seven months. We were guilty of no crimes. And for seven months you refused to sign any papers for our release. At the time, we thought this was surely enough! We do not hate you, NPC men. Neither do we think you hate us. In fact, right in Tomiangan, we helped your men when they had some difficulties or needs. And so, we are all people. Perhaps we can come to an understanding."

7th Kalinga:

"I ask you not to go ahead with the dams! We do not want it. We do not want relocation! Many people have lost their lives only because of your dams! "

8th Kalinga (Tayab of Bugnay):

"It is fortunate you called for us here. We take it as an occasion for us to express our will. It is this: the people, not only of Kalinga, but also of the Mountain Province, do not want to be dislocated! We have more than enough properties to live on. And so, we ask you: relocate the dams! The project has only occasioned the death of many. But we are all brothers! Unless perhaps you regard us as Ilonggots! (At this mention of the Ilonggots, the other Kalingas hiss at him to shut up. They disapprove his words.) Anyway, this is the last time for us to speak our minds. We hope no doubt remains in your minds about our people's will after this."

9th Kalinga:

"There is one more reason for us to reject the dams. You may think only of the material losses we can incur with the construction of the dams. No, it is not only the visible, but also the invisible: our customs, . . . the whole atmosphere in which we live!"

'Perhaps your dams in Apayao will be big enough, why go on with dams in Kalinga? "

(Here again, other Kalingas murmur disapproval at the mention of Apayao.)

At this point, although more Kalingas raise their hands to be given a chance to speak, Macliing motions to them to be silent. Then he goes to the microphone.

Macliing:

"We have said everything we wanted to say. You, who have come to Manila, called us to this meeting, and we came to speak our minds. There is no point in further speeches. Now we want you to answer just one question: DO YOU, OR DO YOU NOT INTEND TO GO AHEAD WITH THE DAMS?" (Macliing returns to his seat, and everybody waits while Itchon tries to compose himself).

G. Itchon:

(Speaking in Ilocano, often groping for words and mixing a lot of Tagalog.)

"The present circumstances make demands on us that we cannot avoid . . . We, too, have our problems as you have stated . . . In 1978, in my talks with Bishop Brasseur and Father Guyguyon, we stated our desire to talk things over with you. Unfortunately, several incidents occurred which prevented us from meeting with you. . . It is like this. . . you come riding in a bus to Baguio. Had you walked to come here, it would have taken you a very long time. You see, we need a lot of gasoline, and the price of oil is increasing very fast. Where it was 2 dollars or 15 pesos per barrel before, now it is 26 dollars for crude and 30 dollars for refined oil . . . You may know that in Bangladesh, no trucks move around anymore. They are too poor to buy oil. Same in other countries in Asia, like in India. In Rumania they have no heating, they have to sell their produce right away. No oil.

"Our Government does not want something like this to happen to us. Imagine if we had no crude oil to produce our electricity! . . . Fortunately for us, we already produce some oil in Palawan. Our government spends a lot of money looking for more sites for oil. . . For instance, the MERALCO, which NPC took over . . . it uses 17 million barrels of oil per year to give electricity to Manila. So you see, the government too, has problems . . . it has to look after the whole welfare of the citizens. And so it wants to harness other sources of energy like geo-thermal . . . Tiwi. . . Makban, etc. And so, it also wants to harness the rivers. By 1990, it is estimated that there will be no more crude oil, and when available, it will sell at 100 dollars per barrel. . . We also have nuclear plants. Although there is danger in these, we need them . . . Bataan.

"All of us suffer from lack of gasoline. We have to look for other means to produce electricity. . . It is not only in Kalinga. . . In Mindanao, there are five hydros under construction. In the Visayas, geo-thermal plants. You know of the Magat hydro, which is for both irrigation and power. This is the problem of the Government. It is not true that we produce electricity, as some people claim, to enrich the rich. The President says we must help one another. That's the reason for the recent elections. . . to give a chance for the people to say whether they want to replace those who are handling their affairs. . . Some people have claimed that we are out only to serve the rich. If this is true, then why should NPC build transmission lines to the Cagayan

Valley, a poor region, at great expense to NPC? It is, rather, to help all the people. We also finished the transmission lines from Cagayan de Oro to Davao, through Bukidnon. We lost a hundred men in the process, but the people now have electricity. Same in Zamboanga.'

'There were protests against the dams in your places. Bishop Claver wrote a very strong letter. I have read all the papers and documents prepared against the project. I have read Father Obin's papers. . . I am very much aware that the project has brought many difficulties and problems to you. But we can help you. If you say you doubt that relocation sites like Gobgob are not to your liking, there are other places for you to choose. We want you to tell us . . . You know, Gobgob was purchased, before I joined NPC. If you don't like it, we won't force it on you.

'The dam will take six years to construct. But the way you talk. . . for instance, 'We prefer to die in our own places because we don't want the dam.' What alternative do you give us? But, as I already said, we can look for other places.

'I am truly thankful that you came so we can know each other's problems. Otherwise we would not know your mind, and you would not know what the Government is facing.'

'Tomorrow, I will be attending the Cabinet meeting. The meeting will tackle the problems arising from the new increase in the price of oil. The Chico Project would save the government 1 million barrels of oil a year. So, think about it.

'And now, I hope, you can understand the answer to your question: WE HAVE NO CHOICE BUT TO GO AHEAD WITH IT.'

(A minute of uneasy silence)

10th Kalinga:

(In English, a representative from Cagaluan.)

'I pose to you three questions, President Itchon. First, do you mean to construct the dams, whether the people affected like it or not?'

'Second, what is really more important to you: the development of things, or the development of people?'

'Third, if you decide in favor of dam construction, are we not in this way being considered non-Filipinos? Or are we third class?'

Itchon:

'Let me put it this way. Suppose you are on the operating table. There is no electricity. . . so you die on the operating table. Or else,

you want to study in college. . . if there is no light, you cannot study. Let me answer your second question. It is really not a matter of 'development of things' over 'development of people'. It is always people, of course. For instance, in Baguio or Manila, with so many people, if there is no electricity, people have no water. No water because there is no electricity to power the pumps. When this happens, people will die. Do you want this? They cry when they have no electricity.'

'Your third question. . . How can you be third class? As you yourselves said a while ago, we are brothers. It is not only in Kalinga where we want to build dams. You tell me, 'Are we third class?' I can tell you that among the Moros, we have built two dams. Four more are planned. We have already built those of Angat, Pantabangan, and here, Binga.'

'You know, I have studied all books and papers on Kalinga. One of those who studied Kalinga, your places, has this to say: 'The number of people constantly increases, while there is no increase in land.' Like my family in Vigan. My father had 20 hectares. . . he had nine children. The land was divided up among us. Later I gave my portion to my brother and looked for a living in Manila to support my family. The land does not grow. This was your problem. too, long before the NPC went there. Think about it. Meanwhile, we can give you an opportunity so you can help your children and grandchildren.'

Macliing:

"It is good that we talk about these things. For us, every good thing comes from the land. Take the NIA dam project. . . people allowed it, there were no objections because they can get good benefits from it.'

'But these dams of yours? Our people object to the project because it destroys the good things we already have!'

'You say people need light. But light is needed only at night! You say electricity is for education. . . let those who study do their studying in the daylight.'

'You mentioned transportation. . . if there is no gasoline, let the trucks stand by.'

'But for us, life itself cannot wait. If you, in your search for good life, at the same time destroy life, we question it. We say that those who need electric light are not thinking of us who are bound to be destroyed. Or will the need for electric lights be a sufficient reason for our own death?''

‘ Therefore, we ask you, search for other means to get electricity. Suppose you yourself are in our place. . . .?’ ”

Itchon:

“Ask NIA how much they can irrigate without our dam. Ask them in Tabuk how much land they can irrigate with the dam. Without the dam, perhaps 10,000 hectares, with the dam, perhaps 60 to 72 thousand hectares. I’m not sure, but ask them.”

11th Kalinga:

“I thought we came to plead with you. Now it turns out you are pleading with us to help you.”

‘ I say, we still prefer to die. And relocation, we shall die anyway! ’ ”

12th Kalinga:

“It may be true that all your big projects are good for people. But how about us people of the affected areas who will surely die.’

‘ You are saying the Government wants the dams at any cost. This dialogue will not benefit us. The people in our respective barrios will be the ones to kill us if we go along with your plans. We would rather go home, then.”

Itchon:

“I am not saying you have to decide now. I have heard your statement of your problems, and I will communicate it to the President.

‘ As you yourselves said, you are deeply troubled. But God gave us brains, not just hands. And so it is not true that when you move out of your places to go elsewhere, you will die there. We use our brains to work out our way to live.”

13th Kalinga:

“God gave us our brains in Kalinga. God gave you yours in Manila. Keep to yours! ”

Itchon:

"All I am saying is, we don't decide now or tomorrow. I only ask you to think it over. Perhaps we will find other occasions in the future to talk about these things."

Macliing:

"While it is true, as you said, that people who have moved to other places may have been able to survive, such people voluntarily left their original barrios in search of lands. But for any of us to be forcibly moved away from our homegrounds. . . this is quite a different matter."

'Here is another matter: If you of NPC had a hand in the appointment of officials and agents in Kalinga whom we know to be hungry for me, let me ask you to cause their removal from Kalinga. I refer especially to the people of what the Government wants to call the KSDR! "

Itchon:

"I thank all of you for having come and talked openly this way. Now I heard it all from you yourselves. And yes, I am going to bring up these things we have talked about here to the President. I can at least assure you of that. Thank you one and all."

Refreshments are served at this point. It is now 7:00 p.m. The Kalingas accept the snacks served. Some accept packs of cigarettes, others refuse 'out of principle'.

7:30 P.M.

A pig and some ducks and chickens are offered to the Kalingas for them to butcher and cook in their own way. When consulted, Macliing, speaking for the group, politely declines the offer. He says to the others, 'there is nothing to celebrate'. The NPC offers basi, and the Kalingas drink their familiar beverage.

A few minutes later, supper is ready. Food is plentiful. The Kalingas eat with gusto and with much animated conversation.

Right after supper, the Kalingas board the hired Dangwa bus. The NPC had offered accommodations for the night at the guesthouses, but the Kalingas, as earlier in the day when they arrived, refused the offer. They wanted to spend the night in Baguio, at Lourdes Church.

At 8:15, the NPC staff see them off. As the Kalingas leave the NPC compound, they burst into a proud singing of their *salidummay*. It is the *opposition salidummay* .